IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

WILDEARTH GUARDIA	NS,)	
	Plaintiff,)	
v.)	1:08-CV-472-CKK
KENNETH SALAZAR, Secretary of the Interior,)))	
	Defendant,)	

STIPULATED SETTLEMENT

Plaintiff WildEarth Guardians ("WildEarth") and Defendant Ken Salazar, in his official capacity as Secretary of the Interior ("Secretary"), by and through their undersigned counsel, state as follows:

WHEREAS, on June 18, 2007, WildEarth submitted a petition to the Secretary to list 475 species in the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's ("Service") Southwest Region as endangered or threatened under the Endangered Species Act ("ESA").

WHEREAS, on July 24, 2007, WildEarth submitted a petition to the Secretary to list 206 species in the Service's Mountain-Prairie Region as endangered or threatened under the ESA.

WHEREAS, within 90 days after receiving a petition and to the maximum extent practicable, the Secretary has a non-discretionary duty to make initial findings as to "whether the petition presents substantial scientific or commercial information indicating that the petitioned action may be warranted." 16 U.S.C. §1533(b)(3)(A).

WHEREAS, on March 19, 2008, WildEarth filed a Complaint for declaratory and injunctive relief alleging that the Secretary failed to comply with the non-discretionary duty to

make initial 90-day findings on all 674 species included in the two petitions above. 16 U.S.C. §1533(b)(3)(A).

WHEREAS, on January 6, 2009, the Service published 90-day findings on 270 of the 475 species listed in the Southwest Region petition. 74 Fed. Reg. 419. On February 5, 2009, the Service published 90-day findings on 165 of the 206 species listed in the Mountain-Prairie Region petition. 74 Fed. Reg. 6,122. WildEarth's claims concerning the Secretary's failure to make 90-day findings regarding these species are now moot.

WHEREAS, to date, the Service has not made 90-day findings on the remaining 200 species from the Southwest petition and has not made 90-day findings on the remaining 39 species² from the Mountain-Prairie petition.

WHEREAS, WildEarth and the Service, through their authorized representatives, and without any admission or final adjudication of the issues of fact or law with respect to WildEarth's claims, have reached a settlement that they consider to be a just, fair, adequate, and equitable resolution of the disputes set forth in WildEarth's Complaint.

WHEREAS, WildEarth and the Service agree that settlement of this action in this manner is in the public interest and is an appropriate way to resolve the dispute between them.

¹ Though WildEarth's original petitions totaled 681 species, WildEarth included six species in both petitions because they were found in both geographic regions and one species was included under two different scientific names. Accordingly, the total number of species included in the two petitions is 674.

The Service will not issue a 90-day finding for the *Sphaeralcea gierischii*, one of the remaining 39 species on the Mountain-Prairie petition, as it is already a candidate for listing as Endangered or Threatened under the ESA, and as such, is listed on the Candidate Notice of Review. 73 Fed. Reg. 75176, 75178 (Dec. 10, 2008). Accordingly, under this agreement, the Service will issue 90-day findings for each of the remaining 38 species listed in the Mountain-Prairie petition on the table below. (See paragraph 1A).

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS STIPULATED BY AND BETWEEN THE PARTIES AS FOLLOWS:

- 1. Pursuant to 16 U.S.C. § 1533(b)(3)(A), the Service agrees to make a finding for each species listed in WildEarth's June 18, 2007, and July 24, 2007, petitions for which no finding has been made, according to the following schedule:
 - A. On or before August 9, 2009, the Service shall submit to the Federal Register a finding as to whether WildEarth's petition presents substantial scientific or commercial information indicating that the petitioned action may be warranted for each the following thirty-eight species (not including the *Sphaeralcea gierischii*), identified in WildEarth's petition to list species in the Mountain-Prairie Region:

Scientific name	Common Name
Astragalus microcymbus	Skiff Milk-vetch
Astragalus schmolliae	Schmoll's Milk-vetch
Corispermum navicula	Boat-shaped Bugseed
Draba weberi	Weber's Whitlow-grass
Eriogonum brandegeei	Brandegee's Wild Buckwheat
Lednia tumana	Meltwater Lednian Stonefly
Amniçola sp. 2	Washington Duskysnail
Discus brunsoni	Lake Disc
Oreohelix amariradix	Bitterroot Mountainsnail
Oreohelix carinifera	Keeled Mountainsnail
Oreohelix sp. 3	Bearmouth Mountainsnail
Oreohelix sp. 4	Drummond Mountainsnail
Oreohelix sp. 31	Byrne Resort Mountainsnail
Lepidomeda copei	Northern Leatherside Chub
Pyrgulopsis anguina	Longitudinal Gland Pyrg
Pyrgulopsis hamlinensis	Hamlin Valley Pyrg
Pyrgulopsis saxatilis	Sub-globose Snake Pyrg
Astragalus hamiltonii	Hamilton's Milk-vetch
Astragalus iselyi	Isely's Milk-vetch
Astragalus sabulosus	Cisco Milk-vetch
Camissonia exilis	Cottonwood Spring Suncup

Cryptantha semiglabra	Pipe Springs Cryptantha
Eriogonum soredium	Frisco Buckwheat
Frasera gypsicola	Sunnyside Green-gentian
Lepidium ostleri	Ostler's Pepper-grass
Lesquerella navajoensis	
Lomatium latilobum	Canyonlands Lomatium
Lygodesmia doloresensis	Dolores River Skeleton-plant
Penstemon flowersii	Flowers' Penstemon
Trifolium friscanum	Frisco Clover
Ironoquia plattensis	Platte River Caddisfly
Sisyrinchium sarmentosum	Pale Blue-eyed-grass
Catinella gelida	Frigid Ambersnail
Abronia ammophila	Yellowstone Sand Verbena
Agrostis rossiae	Ross' Bentgrass
Boechera (Arabis) pusilla	Fremont County Rockcress
Astragalus proimanthus	Precocious Milk-vetch
Penstemon gibbensii	Gibben's Beardtongue

B. On or before December 9, 2009, the Service shall submit to the Federal Register a finding as to whether WildEarth's petition presents substantial scientific or commercial information indicating that the petitioned action may be warranted for each the following two-hundred species, identified in WildEarth's petition to list species in the Southwest Region:

Scientific name	Common Name
Acarospora clauzadeana	A lichen
Adenophyllum wrightii	Wright's Dogweed
Adhemarius blanchardorum	Blanchard's Sphinx Moth
Afilia sp. 1	A Notodontid Moth
Agalinis navasotensis	Navasota False Foxglove
Agapema galbina	Tamaulipan Agapema
Albiorix anophthalmus	A Cave Obligate Pseudoscorpion
Amergoniscus centralis	A Cave Obligate Isopod
Amergoniscus gipsocolus	A Cave Obligate Isopod
Amoreuxia gonzalezii	Santa Rita Yellowshow
Amsonia tharpii	Tharp's Blue-star
Anacroneuria wipukupa	A Stonefly

Aphrastochthonius pachysetus	A Cave Obligate Pseudoscorpion
Apodemia chisosensis	Chisos Metalmark
Archeolarca cavicola	Grand Canyon Cave Scorpion
Arenaria livermorensis	Livermore Sandwort
Argemone arizonica	Arizona Prickle-poppy
Argia sabino	Sabino Dancer
Asclepias prostrata	Prostrate Milkweed
Ashmunella carlsbadensis	Guadelupe Woodlandsnail
Ashmunella hebardi	Hacheta Grande Woodlandsnail
Ashmunella kochii	San Andreas Woodlandsnail
Ashmunella levettei	Huachuca Woodlandsnail
Ashmunella macromphala	Cook's Peak Woodlandsnail
Ashmunella mearnsii	Big Hatchet Woodlandsnail
Aspidoscelis arizonae	Arizona Striped Whiptail
Astragalus hypoxylus	Huachuca Milk-vetch
Astylis sp. 1	A Notodontid Moth
Automeris patagoniensis	Patagonia Eyed Silkmoth
Batesimalva violacea	Purple Gay-mallow
Berberis harrisoniana	Kofka Barberry
Bonamia ovalifolia	Bigpod Bonamia
Bouteloua kayi	Kay Gramma
Cambarus subterraneus	Delaware County Cave Crayfish
Cambarus tartarus	Oklahoma Cave Crayfish
Carex mckittrickensis	Guadalupe Mountain Sedge
Castilleja ornata	Glowing Indian-paintbrush
Ceuthothrombium cavaticum	A Cave Obligate Mite
Chitrellina chiricahuae	A Cave Obligate Pseudoscorpion
Cicindela theatina	Colorado Tiger Beetle
Comaldessus stygius	Comal Springs Diving Beetle
Cooperia smallii	Small's Rainlily
Cryptantha ganderi	Gander's Cryptantha
Cylloepus parkeri	Parker's Cylloepus Riffle Beetle
Cyprinella lepida	Plateau Shiner
Cyprinella sp. 2	Nueces Shiner
Cyprinodon pecosensis	Pecos Pupfish
Cyprinodon tularosa	White Sands Pupfish
Daedalochila hippocrepis	Horseshoe Liptooth
Dalea bartonii	Cox's Dalea
Dalea tentaculoides	Gentry's Indigobush
Echeandia texensis	A plant
Eleocharis cylindrica	Cylinder Spikerush

Erigeron acomanus	Acoma Fleabane
Erigeron bistiensis	Bisti Fleabane
Erigeron piscaticus	Fish Creek Fleabane
Eriogonum mortonianum	Morton's Wild Buckwheat
Escobaria guadalupensis	Guadalupe Pincushion Cactus
Euglandina texasiana	Glossy Wolfsnail
Euhyparpax rosea	A Notodontid Moth
Euphorbia aaron-rossii	Marble Canyon Spurge
Eurycea neotenes	Texas Salamander
Eurycea robusta	Blanco Blind Salamander
Eurycea sp. 6	Pedernales River Springs Salamander
Eurycea sp. 8	Comal Springs Salamander
Eurycea tridentifera	Comal Blind Salamander
Fryxellia pygmaea	Fryxell's Pygmy Mallow
Fusconaia lananensis	Triangle Pigtoe
Gambusia clarkhubbsi	San Felipe Gambusia
Genistidium dumosum	Brush-pea
Geomys streckeri	Strecker's Pocket Gopher
Glossopetalon texense	Texas Grease Bush
Grimmia americana	A plant
Haideoporus texanus	Edwards Aquifer Diving Beetle
Hedyotis pooleana	Jackie's Bluet
Helicodiscus nummus	Wax Coil
Heterocampa sp. 1 nr. amanda	A Notodontid Moth
Hexalectris revoluta	Chisos Coralroot
Holospira hamiltoni	Hamilton Holospira
Holospira mesolia	Widemouth Holospira
Holospira oritis	Mountain Holospira
Holospira pasonis	Robust Holospira
Holospira pityis	Pinecone Holospira
Holospira riograndensis	Rio Grand Holospira
Holospira yucatanensis	Bartsch Holospira
Holsingerius samacos	A Cave Obligate Amphipod
Humboldtiana edithae	Boulder Slide Threeband
Hydroptila ouachita	A Purse Casemaker Caddisfly
Hydroptila protera	A Caddisfly
lctalurus sp. 1	Chihuahua Catfish
Kallstroemia perennans	Perennial Caltrop
Lachlania dencyannae	A Mayfly
Lampsilis bracteata	Texas Fatmucket
Lesquerella kaibabensis	Kaibab Bladderpod

Limnephilus adapus	A Caddisfly
Lirceolus smithii	Texas Troglobitic Water Slater
Litodonta sp. 1 nr. alpina	A Notodontid Moth
Lycaena ferrisi	Ferris's Copper
Macrhybopsis tetranema	Arkansas River Speckled Chub
Maricopella allynsmithi	Squaw Park Talussnail
Marstonia comalensis	Comal Siltsnail
Melanoplus sp. 22	An invertebrate
Melanoplus sp. 26	An invertebrate
Melanoplus sp. 36	An invertebrate
Melanoplus sp. 48	An invertebrate
Melanoplus sp. 52	An invertebrate
Melanoplus sp. 62	An invertebrate
Melanoplus sp. 9	An invertebrate
Microdynerus arenicolus	Antioch Potter Wasp
Neoleptoneta anopica	A Cave Obligate Spider
Notophthalmus meridionalis	Black-spotted Newt
Omphalora arizonica	A lichen
Oncopodura prietoi	A Cave Obligate Springtail
Opuntia aureispina	Golden-spined Prickly-pear
Opuntia densispina	Big Bend Prickly-pear
Orconectes saxatilis	Kiamichi Crayfish
Oreohelix pilsbryi	Mineral Creek Mountainsnail
Palaemonetes holthuisi	A Cave Obligate Decapod
Papaipema eryngii	Rattlesnake-master Borer Moth
Paramexiweckelia ruffoi	Ruffo's Cave Amphipod
Paronychia congesta	Bushy Whitlow-wort
Pediomelum humile	Rydberg's Scurfpea
Pediomelum pentaphyllum	Chihuahua Scurfpea
Perityle cochisensis	Cochise Rockdaisy
Perityle huecoensis	Hueco Mountains Rockdaisy
Perityle saxicola	Fish Creek Rock Daisy
Perityle warnockii	River Rockdaisy
Phreatodrobia imitata	Mimic Cavesnail
Phylocentropus harrisi	A Caddisfly
Pisidium sanguinichristi	Sangre de Cristo Peaclam
Pleurobema riddellii	Louisiana Pigtoe
Potamilus amphichaenus	Texas Heelsplitter
Potamilus metnecktayi	Salina Mucket
Procambarus brazoriensis	Brazoria Crayfish
Procambarus nechesae	Neches Crayfish

Procambarus nigrocinctus	Blackbelted Crayfish
Procambarus texanus	Bastrop Crayfish
Protoptila arca	San Marcos Saddle-case Caddisfly
Pseudosinella vita	A Cave Obligate Springtail
Pseudosubulina cheatumi	Chisos Foxsnail
Ptomaphagus cocytus	A Cave Obligate Beetle
Pyrgulopsis arizonae	Bylas Springsnail
Pyrgulopsis bacchus	Grand Wash Springsnail
Pyrgulopsis conica	Kingman Springsnail
Pyrgulopsis davisi	Limpia Creek Springsnail
Pyrgulopsis glandulosa	Verde Rim Springsnail
Pyrgulopsis metcalfi	Naegele Springsnail
Pyrgulopsis montezumensis	Montezuma Well Springsnail
Pyrgulopsis pecosensis	Pecos Springsnail
Pyrgulopsis simplex	Fossil Springsnail
Quadrula aurea	Golden Orb
Quercus acerifolia	Mapleleaf Oak
Quercus boyntonii	Boynton's Sand Post Oak
Quercus graciliformis	Slender Oak
Quercus robusta	Robust Oak
Quercus tardifolia	Chisos Mountains Oak
Radiocentrum ferrissi	Fringed Mountainsnail
Rana subaguavocalis	Ramsey Canyon Leopard Frog
Rhododon angulatus	Lonestar Sand-mint
Riccia californica	A plant
Salvia pentstemonoides	Big Red Sage
Satan eurystomus	Widemouth Blindcat
Selinocarpus maloneanus	Malone Mountains Moonpod
Senna ripleyana	Ripley's Senna
Solanum leptosepalum	Tigna Potato
Sonorella christenseni	Clark Peak Talussnail
Sonorella eremita	San Xavier Talussnail
Sonorella grahamensis	Pinaleno Talussnail
Sonorella huecoensis	Hueco Mountains Talus Snail
Sonorella macrophallus	Wet Canyon Talussnail
Sonorella papagorum	Black Mountain Talussnail
Sonorella pedregosensis	Leslie Canyon Talussnail
Sonorella sp. 1	A Terrestrial Snail
Sonorella todseni	Dona Ana Talussnail
Sophora gypsophila	Gypsum Necklace
Sphaeromicola moria	A Cave Obligate Shrimp

Sphingicampa blanchardi	A Royal Moth
Sphingicampa raspa	A Royal Moth
Sphinx eremitoides	Sage Sphinx
Sphinx smithi	A Sphinx Moth
Stallingsia maculosus	Manfreda Giant-skipper
Stellaria porsildii	Porsild's Starwort
Streptocephalus moorei	Spinythumb Fairy Shrimp
Stygobromus limbus	Border Cave Amphipod
Texiweckelia relicta	A Cave Obligate Amphipod
Thymoites minero	A Cave Obligate Spider
Tomocerus grahami	A Cave Obligate Springtail
Toxolasma corvunculus	Southern Purple Lilliput
Trogloglanis pattersoni	Toothless Blindcat
Tryonia gilae	Gilae Tryonia
Tryonia quitobaquitae	Quitobaquito Tryonia
Ursia furtiva	A Notodontid Moth
Ursia sp. 1	A Notodontid Moth
Valerianella nutta <u>llii</u>	Nuttall's Corn-salad
Xanthoparmelia planilobata	A lichen
Yucca necopina	Brazos River Yucca

In consideration of the Service's agreement to meet these deadlines, WildEarth agrees to dismiss this action with prejudice.

- 2. Either party may seek to modify the deadline for any actions specified in Paragraph 1 for good cause shown, consistent with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. In that event, or in the event that either party believes that the other party has failed to comply with any term or condition of this Agreement, the parties shall use the dispute resolution procedures specified in Paragraph 3.
- 3. The Order entering this Agreement may be modified by the Court upon good cause shown, consistent with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, by written stipulation between the parties filed with and approved by the Court, or upon written motion filed by one of the parties and granted by the Court. In the event that either party seeks to modify the terms of this

Agreement, including the deadline for the actions specified in Paragraph 1, or in the event of a dispute arising out of or relating to this Agreement, or in the event that either party believes that the other party has failed to comply with any term or condition of this Agreement, the party seeking the modification, raising the dispute or seeking enforcement, shall provide the other party with written notice of the claim. The parties agree that they will meet and confer (in-person not required) at the earliest possible time in a good-faith effort to resolve the claim before pursuing relief from the Court. If the parties are unable to resolve the claim within a reasonable time, either party may seek relief from the Court.

- 4. No party shall use this Agreement or the terms herein as evidence of what does or does not constitute a reasonable time line for issuing a 90-day finding under 16 U.S.C. § 1533 or in any other proceeding regarding the Service's implementation of the ESA.
- 5. Defendant agrees that Plaintiff is the "prevailing party" in this action, and agrees to pay Plaintiffs reasonable attorneys' fees and costs, pursuant to Section 11(g) of the ESA, 16 U.S.C. § 1540 (g). Therefore, Defendant agrees to settle all of Plaintiff's claims for costs and attorneys' fees in the above-captioned litigation for a total of \$17,492.00. A check will be made payable in that amount to WildEarth Guardians, 6439 E. Maplewood Ave., Centennial, CO 80111.
- 6. Defendant agrees to submit all necessary paperwork for the processing of the attorneys' fee award to the Department of the Treasury's Judgment Fund Office, pursuant to 16 U.S.C. § 1540(g)(4), within ten (10) business days of receipt of the court order approving this stipulation.

- 7. Plaintiff agrees to accept payment of \$17,492.00 in full satisfaction of any and all claims for attorneys' fees and costs of litigation to which Plaintiff is entitled in the above-captioned litigation, through and including the date of this agreement.
- 8. Plaintiff agrees that receipt of this payment from Defendant shall operate as a release of Plaintiff's claims for attorneys' fees and costs in this matter, through and including the date of this agreement.
- 9. Plaintiff reserves the right to seek additional fees and costs incurred subsequent to this agreement arising from a need to enforce or defend against efforts to modify the underlying schedule outlined in Paragraph 1, or for any other unforeseen continuation of this action.
- 10. Defendant does not waive any right to contest fees claimed by Plaintiff or Plaintiff's counsel, including the hourly rate, in any future litigation, or continuation of the present action. Further, this stipulation as to attorneys' fees and costs has no precedential value and shall not be used as evidence in any other attorneys' fees litigation.
- 11. Subject to the qualifications in Paragraph 12, no provision of this Agreement shall be interpreted as, or constitute, a commitment or requirement that Defendant takes action in contravention of the Endangered Species Act, the Administrative Procedure Act, or any other law or regulation, either substantive or procedural. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed to limit or modify the discretion accorded to the Service by the ESA, the APA, or general principles of administrative law with respect to the procedures to be followed in making any determination required herein, or as to the substance of any final determination.
- 12. No provision of this Agreement shall be interpreted as, or constitute, a commitment or requirement that Defendant is obligated to spend funds in violation of the Anti-Deficiency

Act, 31 U.S.C. § 1341. In response, Plaintiff asserts that this Agreement does not create a conflict with the Anti-Deficiency Act because the duty to make petition findings is required in non-discretionary terms by the ESA and because the Anti-Deficiency Act would not excuse compliance with a pre-existing court-approved Agreement. Plaintiff may assert this position if Defendant fails to comply with the terms of this Agreement for reasons of insufficient appropriations. Defendant reserves all legal and equitable defense to any argument by Plaintiff that the Anti-Deficiency Act does not apply to non-discretionary duties required by the ESA.

- 13. The parties agree that this Agreement was negotiated in good faith and it constitutes a settlement of claims that were vigorously contested, denied, and disputed by the parties. By entering into this Agreement the parties do not waive any claim or defense.
- 14. The undersigned representatives of each party certify that they are fully authorized by the party or parties they represent to agree to the Court's entry of the terms and conditions of this Agreement and do hereby agree to the terms herein.
- 15. The terms of this Agreement shall become effective upon entry of an order by the Court ratifying the Agreement.
- 16. Upon approval of this Agreement by the Court, all counts of Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint shall be dismissed with prejudice, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 41(a)(1). Notwithstanding the dismissal of this action, the parties hereby stipulate and respectfully request that the Court retain jurisdiction to oversee compliance with the terms of this Agreement and to resolve any motions to modify such terms. *See Kokkonen v. Guardian Life Ins. Co. of Am.*, 511 U.S. 375 (1994).

Respectfully submitted this 13th day of March, 2009, JOHN C. CRUDEN, Acting Assistant Attorney General

JEAN E. WILLIAMS, Section Chief LISA L. RUSSELL, Assistant Chief s/Rickey D. Turner Jr.
RICKEY D. TURNER JR.
U.S. Department of Justice
Environment & Natural Resources Division Wildlife and Marine Resources Section P.O. Box. 7369
Washington, D.C. 20044-7369
(202) 305-0229
rickey.turner@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Defendants

s/ James Jay Tutchton (w/ permission by RDT)
JAMES JAY TUTCHTON, *Pro Hac Vice*1536 Wynkoop Street, Suite 300
Denver, CO 80202
(720) 301-3843
jtutchton@wildearthguardians.org

Attorney for Plaintiff

PROPOSED ORDER

The terms and conditions of this Stipulated Settlement Agreement are hereby adopted as an enforceable ORDER of this Court.

Dated: this 13th day of March 2009.

United States District Judge

WILDEARTH GUARDIANS v. KENNETH SALAZAR

1:08-CV-472-CKK